



### Non-local Correlations in Electronic Structure Scheme: Beyond DMFT

A. Lichtenstein University of Hamburg

In collaborations with:

A. Rubtsov (Moscow), M. Katsnelson (Nijmegen)H. Monien and G. Li (Bonn)H. Hafermann, C. Jung and S. Brener (Hamburg)

### Outline

- Correlated systems: Non-local effects
- 'Good' Cluster-DMFT = Double-Bethe
- Magnetic nanosystems: CTQMC
- Beyond DMFT Dual Fermions
- Superperturbation on real axes
- Conclusions

### STM: non-local spin-nanostructures





### 2d-AMF structure R. Wiesendanger (UH)

Quantum corral D. Eigler (IBM)

# From Atom to Solids



- How to incorporate atomic physics in the band structure ?
- How good is a local approximation ?
- What is a best solution for atomic problem in effective medium ?
- What is different from one band Hubbard model?
- How to solve a complicated Quantum multiorbital problem ?
- What is the best Tight-Binding scheme for realistic Many-Body calculation for solids?

### Model: correlated exchange-triangle

a) Is the difference between Heisenberg and Ising types of the exchange interaction essential? b) How does geometry of the problem affect on Kondo response of the system?



$$S = S_0 + W$$

$$S_0 = -\int_0^\beta \int_0^\beta d\tau d\tau' \sum_{i,j;\sigma} c_{i\sigma}^{\dagger}(\tau) \mathcal{G}_{ij}^{-1}(\tau - \tau') c_{j\sigma}(\tau')$$

$$W = \int_0^\beta d\tau \left( U \sum_i n_{i\uparrow}(\tau) n_{i\downarrow}(\tau) + \sum_{i,j} J_{ij} \mathbf{S}_i(\tau) \mathbf{S}_j(\tau) \right)$$

$$\mathcal{G}_{ij}^{-1} = \mathcal{G}_i^{-1} \delta_{ij} - t_{ij}$$

$$\mathcal{G}_i^{-1}(i\omega_n) = \mu + i(\omega_n + \sqrt{\omega_n^2 + 1})/2$$

First term – Hubbard repulsion

Interaction W

Second term – intersite exchange interaction

### **Continuous Time QMC formalism**

Formal perturbation-series:  

$$Z = \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \int dr_{1} \int dr'_{1} \dots \int dr_{2k} \int dr'_{2k} \Omega_{k}(r_{1}, r'_{1}, \dots, r_{2k}, r'_{2k})$$

$$\Omega_{k}(r_{1}, r'_{1}, \dots, r_{2k}, r'_{2k}) = Z_{0} \frac{(-1)^{k}}{k!} w_{r_{1}r_{2}}^{r'_{1}r'_{2}} \dots w_{r_{2k-1}r'_{2k}}^{r'_{2k-1}r'_{2k}} D_{r'_{1}\dots r'_{2k}}^{r_{1}\dots r'_{2k}}$$

$$D_{r'_{1}\dots r'_{2k}}^{r_{1}\dots r'_{2k}} = \left\langle T\left(c_{r'_{1}}^{+}c^{r_{1}} - \alpha_{r'_{1}}^{\eta}\right) \dots \left(c_{r'_{2k}}^{+}c^{r_{2k}} - \alpha_{r'_{2k}}^{r_{2k}}\right) \right\rangle$$
Since S<sub>0</sub> is Gaussian one can apply the Wick theorem
$$D \text{ can be presented as a determinant g0}$$
The Green function can be calculated as follows
$$g_{r'}^{r}(k) = \frac{\left\langle Tc_{r'}^{+}c^{r}\left(c_{r'_{1}}^{+}c^{r_{1}} - \alpha_{r'_{1}}^{r_{1}}\right) \dots \left(c_{r'_{2k}}^{+}c_{r'_{2k}}^{r_{2k}} - \alpha_{r'_{2k}}^{r_{2k}}\right) \right\rangle}{\left\langle T\left(c_{r'_{1}}^{+}c^{r_{1}} - \alpha_{r'_{1}}^{r_{1}}\right) \dots \left(c_{r'_{2k}}^{+}c_{r'_{2k}}^{r_{2k}} - \alpha_{r'_{2k}}^{r_{2k}}\right) \right\rangle}$$
In practice efficient calculation of a ratio is possible due to fast-update formulas
$$\alpha - \text{for sign problem !}$$

A. Rubtsov and A.L., JETP Lett. 80, 61 (2004)

#### Random walks in the k space



## CT-QMC: fast update k -> k+1

$$G^{(k)} = \begin{pmatrix} G_{1,1} & G_{1,2} & \dots & G_{1,k} & 0 \\ G_{2,1} & G_{2,2} & \dots & G_{2,k} & 0 \\ \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots \\ G_{k,1} & G_{k,2} & \dots & G_{k,k} & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & \dots & 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \qquad G^{(k+1)} = \begin{pmatrix} G_{1,1} & G_{1,2} & \dots & G_{1,k} & G_{1,k+1} \\ G_{2,1} & G_{2,1} & \dots & G_{2,k} & G_{2,k+1} \\ \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots \\ G_{k,1} & G_{k,2} & \dots & G_{k,k} & G_{k,k+1} \\ G_{k+1,1} & G_{k+1,2} & \dots & G_{k+1,k} & G_{k+1,k+1} \end{pmatrix}$$

$$M_{(k+1)} = M_{(k)} [1 + \Delta M_{(k)}]^{-1} \qquad M_{(k)} = G_{(k)}^{-1}$$
  
$$M_{(k+1)} = G_{(k+1)}^{-1}$$
  
$$\Delta = G_{(k+1)} - G_{(k)}$$

$$M_{k+1} = \begin{pmatrix} M_{i,j} + L_{i,k+1}\alpha R_{k+1,j} & -L_{i,k+1}\alpha \\ -\alpha R_{k+1,j} & \alpha \end{pmatrix} \qquad \begin{array}{ccc} R_{i,j} &=& G_{in}M_{nj} \\ L_{i,j} &=& M_{in}G_{nj} \\ \alpha^{-1} = G_{k+1,k+1} - G_{k+1n}M_{nm}G_{mk+1} \end{array}$$

N<sup>2</sup> operations

# Magnetism vs. Kondo resonance



M. Crommie, PRL(2001)

Three impurity atoms with Hubbard repulsion and exchange interaction

$$Un_{i\uparrow}n_{i\downarrow} + J_{ij}\vec{S}_i\vec{S}_j$$



CT-QMC: single vs. trimer V. Savkin et al, PRL (2005)

### 'Good' Cluster - VO<sub>2</sub>: singlet formation

M. Marezio et al., (1972)





### Double-Bethe Lattice: exact C-DMFT

bilayer Hubbard model on the Bethe lattice (for coordination z = 3)

G. Moeller , V. Dobrosavljevic, and A. Ruckenstein PRB (1999)



$$\begin{aligned} H &= -t \sum_{\langle ij \rangle, \sigma} (a_{i\sigma}^{\dagger} a_{j\sigma} + b_{i\sigma}^{\dagger} b_{j\sigma}) - t_{\perp} \sum_{i\sigma} (a_{i\sigma}^{\dagger} b_{i\sigma} + b_{i\sigma}^{\dagger} a_{i\sigma}) \\ &+ U \sum_{i\sigma} (n_{ai\uparrow} n_{ai\downarrow} + n_{bi\uparrow} n_{bi\downarrow}) \end{aligned}$$

### Self-consistent condition: C-DMFT



$$\mathcal{G}_{\sigma}^{-1}(i\omega_n) = \begin{pmatrix} i\omega_n + \mu - h\sigma & -t_{\perp} \\ -t_{\perp} & i\omega_n + \mu + h\sigma \end{pmatrix} - t^2 \mathbf{G}_{-\sigma}(i\omega_n) ,$$

AF-between plane

AF-plane

## Finite temperature phase diagram



- order-disorder transition at t $\perp$  / t= $\sqrt{2}$  for large U
- MIT for intermediate U

H. Hafermann EPL(2009)



## Spin-correlations: large U



► formation of a coherent state for  $t_{\perp}/t > \sqrt{2}$ 

magnetic order is supressed by singlet formation

### CT-QMC measuring $\chi$ in imaginary time

 $\chi_{\mathsf{loc}}(\tau) = \langle S^{z}(\tau) S^{z}(0) \rangle \\ \langle c_{\sigma}^{\dagger}(\tau) c_{\sigma}(\tau) c_{\sigma}^{\dagger}(0) c_{\sigma}(0) \rangle = \langle \tilde{g}_{\sigma}(\tau, \tau) \tilde{g}_{\sigma'}(0, 0) \rangle - \delta_{\sigma, \sigma'} \langle \tilde{g}_{\sigma}(\tau, 0) \tilde{g}_{\sigma'}(0, \tau) \rangle$ 



## Dynamical susceptibility



Goldstone mode for small t⊥
 singlet-triplet excitation at ~ J<sub>||</sub> = 4t<sup>2</sup>/U = 0.5\_

Beyond DMFT: Dual Fermion scheme  
General Lattice Action 
$$H = h + U$$
  
 $S[c^*, c] = \sum_{\omega kmm'\sigma} [h_k^{mm'} - (i\omega + \mu)1] c^*_{\omega km\sigma} c_{\omega km'\sigma} + \frac{1}{4} \sum_{i\{m,\sigma\}} \int_0^\beta U_{1234} c_1^* c_2^* c_3 c_4 d\tau$   
Optimal Local Action with hybridization  $\Delta_{\omega}$   
 $S_{loc} = \sum_{\omega mm'\sigma} [\Delta_{\omega}^{mm'} - (i\omega + \mu)1] c^*_{\omega m\sigma} c_{\omega m'\sigma} + \frac{1}{4} \sum_{i\{m,\sigma\}} \int_0^\beta U_{1234} c_1^* c_2^* c_3 c_4 d\tau$   
Lattice-Impurity connection:  
 $S[c^*, c] = \sum_i S_{loc}[c^*_i, c_i] + \sum_{\omega kmm'\sigma} (h_k^{mm'} - \Delta_{\omega}^{mm'}) c^*_{\omega km\sigma} c_{\omega km'\sigma}.$ 

A. Rubtsov, et al, Phys. Rev. B (2008)

## **Dual Fermions**

Gaussian path-integral

$$\int D[\vec{f}^*, \vec{f}] \exp(-\vec{f}^* \hat{A} \vec{f} + \vec{f}^* \hat{B} \vec{c} + \vec{c}^* \hat{B} \vec{f}) = \det(\hat{A}) \exp(\vec{c}^* \hat{B} \hat{A}^{-1} \hat{B} \vec{c})$$
  
With  $\begin{array}{l} A = g_{\omega}^{-1} (\Delta_{\omega} - h_k) g_{\omega}^{-1} \\ B = g_{\omega}^{-1} \end{array}$ 

new Action:

$$S_d[f^*, f] = -\sum_{k\omega\sigma} \mathcal{G}_{k\omega\sigma}^{-1} f_{k\omega\sigma}^* f_{k\omega\sigma} + \frac{1}{4} \sum_{1234} \gamma_{1234}^{(4)} f_1^* f_2^* f_4 f_3 + \gamma^{(6)} \dots$$

here:

$$\mathcal{G}_{k\omega}^{-1} = [g_{\omega} (h_k - \Delta_{\omega}) g_{\omega}]^{-1} - g_{\omega}^{-1}$$

$$\gamma_{1234}^{(4)} = g_{11'}^{-1} g_{22'}^{-1} (\chi_{1'2'3'4'} - \chi_{1'2'3'4'}^{0}) g_{3'3}^{-1} g_{4'4}^{-1}$$

$$g_{\omega} \text{ and } \chi_{\nu,\nu',\omega} \text{ from DMFT}$$

### Basic diagrams for dual self-energy



Lines denote the renormalized Green's function.

## Condition for $\Delta$ and relation with DMFT

To determine  $\triangle$ , we require that Hartree correction in dual variables vanishes. If no higher diagrams are taken into account, one obtains DMFT:

$$G^{d}=G^{DMFT}-g$$

$$\sum_{k} \mathcal{G}_{k\omega}^{d} = 0 \longrightarrow \sum_{k} \left[ g_{\omega} - (h_{k} - \Delta_{\omega})^{-1} \right]^{-1} = 0$$

Higher-order diagrams give corrections to the DMFT self-energy, and already the leading-order correction is nonlocal.



### **Dual and Lattice Green's Functions**

The partition function can be written in two equivalent forms:

$$Z = \int \exp(-S[c^*, c]) \mathcal{D}[\mathbf{c}, \mathbf{c}^*] = \prod_{\omega \mathbf{k}\sigma} \det[g_{\omega\sigma} (\Delta_{\omega\sigma} - H_{\sigma}(\mathbf{k})) g_{\omega\sigma}] \times \int \int \exp(-S[\mathbf{c}^*, \mathbf{c}, \mathbf{f}^*, \mathbf{f}]) \mathcal{D}[\mathbf{f}, \mathbf{f}^*] \mathcal{D}[\mathbf{c}, \mathbf{c}^*]$$

► the dual transformation ensures an*exact* relation between  $G_{\omega \mathbf{k}\sigma}^{\text{dual}} = -\langle T \mathbf{f}_{\omega \mathbf{k}\sigma} \mathbf{f}_{\omega \mathbf{k}\sigma}^* \rangle$  and  $G_{\omega \mathbf{k}\sigma} = -\langle T \mathbf{c}_{\omega \mathbf{k}\sigma} \mathbf{c}_{\omega \mathbf{k}\sigma}^* \rangle$ 

$$\begin{array}{lll} \mathcal{G}_{\omega\mathbf{k}\sigma} &=& (\Delta_{\omega\sigma} - \mathcal{H}_{\sigma}(\mathbf{k}))^{-1} \ g_{\omega\sigma}^{-1} \ \mathcal{G}_{\omega\mathbf{k}\sigma}^{\mathsf{dual}} \ g_{\omega\sigma}^{-1} \ (\Delta_{\omega\sigma} - \mathcal{H}_{\sigma}(\mathbf{k}))^{-1} \\ &+& (\Delta_{\omega\sigma} - \mathcal{H}_{\sigma}(\mathbf{k}))^{-1} \end{array}$$

### Cluster Dual Fermions: 1d-test, n=1

#### 1D Hubbard chain U/t = 6, $\beta = 10$ , $\epsilon(\mathbf{k}) = -2t \cos(ka)$



## ARPES: Im $\Sigma(k, \omega=0)$



Hubbard model with  $8t = 2, \beta = 20$  at half-filling. Data for Im  $\Sigma_k$  at  $\omega = 0$ .

A. Rubtsov, et al, Phys. Rev. B (2008)

## AFM – symmetry breaking



### Pseudogap in HTSC: dual fermions

$$S[f, f^*] = \sum_{\omega k \sigma} g_{\omega}^{-2} \left( (\Delta_{\omega} - \epsilon_k)^{-1} + g_{\omega} \right) f_{\omega k \sigma}^* f_{\omega k \sigma} + \sum_i V_i$$



### **Quasiparticle dispersion**



### **Two-particle Green-Functions**

Exact relation between dual and lattice two-particle Green functions (symbolically):

$$\chi(k,k';q) = \langle T\mathbf{c}_{k+q}\mathbf{c}_k^*\mathbf{c}_{k'}\mathbf{c}_{k'+q}^* \rangle$$

$$\chi - G \otimes G = \left[ (\Delta - H)^{-1} g^{-1} \right] \left[ (\Delta - H)^{-1} g^{-1} \right] \left( \chi^d - G^d \otimes G^d \right) \times \left[ g^{-1} (\Delta - H)^{-1} \right] \left[ g^{-1} (\Delta - H)^{-1} \right]$$

two-particle excitations for dual and original fermions are the same!

S. Brener et al. PRB (2008)

### **Bethe-Salpeter Equations**

Three channels:







## Susceptibility: DF vs.DMFT

DMFT approximation for 2PGF:

$$\chi - {\cal G}^{\sf D} \otimes {\cal G}^{\sf D} = {\cal G}^{\sf D} {\cal G}^{\sf D} \gamma^{\sf ir} \chi$$

with

$$\gamma^{(4)} = \gamma^{\rm ir} + \gamma^{\rm ir} \, g \, g \, \gamma^{(4)}$$

► Not recovered completely in the lowest non-trivial order of DF:  $\chi - G^{D} \otimes G^{D} = G^{D}G^{D}\gamma^{(4)}G^{D}G^{D}$ 

$$g = G^{\mathsf{D}} - G^{\mathsf{d},\mathsf{0}}$$



## Convergence of Dual Fermions: 2d





H. Hafermann, arXiv:0812.2456

## Magnetic susceptibility: exact results



For local correlated system - exact separation:

$$\chi_{\nu,\nu'}^{-1}(\vec{q},\omega) = \chi_{0,\nu,\nu'}^{-1}(\vec{q},\omega) - \gamma_{\nu,\nu'}(\omega)$$

### Susceptibility: 2d – Hubbard model



## Bethe-Salpeter equation: pp-channel



*U=W t'/t=-0.3 x=15%* 

$$\frac{1}{2\beta N^d} \sum_{\omega' \mathbf{k}'_1} \gamma_{p\omega\omega'\Omega=0}^{\mathsf{irr},s/t} (\mathbf{k},\mathbf{k}',\mathbf{q}=0) G_{-\omega'}^{\mathsf{d}}(-\mathbf{k}') G_{\omega'}^{\mathsf{d}}(\mathbf{k}') \phi_{\omega'}(\mathbf{k}') = \lambda \phi_{\omega}(\mathbf{k})$$

1

### d-wave symmetry of the eigenfunction



H. Hafermann et al. J. Supercond. Novel Mag. 22, 45 (2009)

### Superperturbation around ED



$$G_{12} = [g(Dg+1)^{-1}]_{12} - [(1+gD)^{-1}]_{11'} \times (\chi - \chi^0)_{1'2'3'4'} [(g+D^{-1})^{-1}]_{4'3'} [(Dg+1)^{-1}]_{2'2}$$

H. Hafermann et al, arXiv:0809.1051

## Two-particle GF: H. Lehmann

$$\chi^{\sigma\sigma'}_{\omega_1\omega_2\omega_3} = \frac{1}{\beta^2} \int_0^\beta d\tau_1 \int_0^\beta d\tau_2 \int_0^\beta d\tau_3 \, e^{i(\omega_1\tau_1 + \omega\tau_2 + \omega_3\tau_3)} \langle T_\tau c_\sigma(\tau_1) c^{\dagger}_{\sigma}(\tau_2) c_{\sigma'}(\tau_3) c^{\dagger}_{\sigma'}(0) \rangle$$

$$\chi_{\omega_{1}\omega_{2}\omega_{3}}^{\sigma\sigma'} = \frac{1}{\mathcal{Z}} \sum_{ijkl} \sum_{\Pi} \phi(E_{i}, E_{j}, E_{k}, E_{l}, \omega_{\Pi_{1}}, \omega_{\Pi_{2}}, \omega_{\Pi_{3}}) \operatorname{sgn}(\Pi) \langle i|\mathcal{O}_{\Pi_{1}}|j\rangle \langle j|\mathcal{O}_{\Pi_{2}}|k\rangle \langle k|\mathcal{O}_{\Pi_{3}}|l\rangle \langle l|c_{\sigma'}^{\dagger}|i\rangle$$

$$\begin{split} \phi(E_{i}, E_{j}, E_{k}, E_{l}, \omega_{1}, \omega_{2}, \omega_{3}) &= \frac{1}{i\omega_{3} + E_{k} - E_{l}} \times \\ \left[ \frac{1 - \delta_{\omega_{2}, -\omega_{3}} \delta_{E_{j}, E_{l}}}{i(\omega_{2} + \omega_{3}) + E_{j} - E_{l}} \left( \frac{e^{-\beta E_{i}} + e^{-\beta E_{j}}}{i\omega_{1} + E_{i} - E_{j}} - \frac{e^{-\beta E_{i}} + e^{-\beta E_{l}}}{i(\omega_{1} + \omega_{2} + \omega_{3}) + E_{i} - E_{l}} \right) \\ &+ \delta_{\omega_{2}, -\omega_{3}} \delta_{E_{j}, E_{l}} \left( \frac{e^{-\beta E_{i}} + e^{-\beta E_{j}}}{(i\omega_{1} + E_{i} - E_{j})^{2}} - \beta \frac{e^{-\beta E_{j}}}{i\omega_{1} + E_{i} - E_{j}} \right) - \frac{1}{i\omega_{2} + E_{j} - E_{k}} \times \\ &\left( \frac{e^{-\beta E_{i}} + e^{-\beta E_{j}}}{i\omega_{1} + E_{i} - E_{j}} - (1 - \delta_{\omega_{1}, -\omega_{2}} \delta_{E_{i}, E_{k}}) \frac{e^{-\beta E_{i}} - e^{-\beta E_{k}}}{i(\omega_{1} + \omega_{2}) + E_{i} - E_{k}} + \beta e^{-\beta E_{i}} \delta_{\omega_{1}, -\omega_{2}} \delta_{E_{i}, E_{k}} \right) \right] \end{split}$$

### Impurity test: semirsircular DOS



## Real-axis scheme: First Diagram



### SIAM in Magnetic field





∆**=**0.01

0.10

NCA-K. Haule

FIG. 4. Shift of the spectral function with increasing magnetic field<sub>30</sub>t zero temperature. The impurity parameters are



## Conclusions

- Electronic Structure and Magnetism of nonlocal correlated systems can be described in CTQMC + DF scheme
- Exact Spin Dynamics for magnetic nanosystems with vertex corrections can be calculated within CTQMC