The Role of Non-Local and Non-Equilibrium Physics in High Energy Density Plasmas **IPAM - UCLA Computational Methods in High Energy Density Plasmas** -----V STREET & JOOL AS PLICERED BEER BEER

US NAVAL RESEARCH LABORATORY The Navy and Marine Corps Corporate Laboratory Dr. Tom Mehlhorn Plasma Physics Division tom.mehlhorn@nrl.navy.mil 27 March 2012



## Thanks to the many NRL researchers who have contributed to this talk



#### **<u>1. Non-LTE in radiation-dominated K-shell Z-pinches:</u>**

- Dr. Arati Dasgupta
- Dr. John Giuliani
- Dr. Ward Thornhill

Ref: J.W. Thornhill, J.L. Giuliani, A. Dasgupta, et al., IEEE Trans. Plasma Sci., 38, 606 (2010).

#### 2. Non-local electron transport in laser fusion

Dr. Wally Mannheimer

Dr. Andy Schmitt

Ref: W. Manheimer, D. Colombant and V. Goncharov, Phys. Plasmas, 15, 083103, 2008

#### 3. Non-equilibrium physics in clusters irradiated by ultra-short pulsed laser (USPL)

Dr. Jack Davis Dr. George Petrov Dr. Lina Petrova *Ref:* G.M Petrov, J. Davis, Phys. Plasmas 15, 056705 (2008)

#### Atomic physics and non-LTE Effects

J. Davis, R. Clark, M. Blaha, & J. Giuliani, Lasers & Part Beams 19, 557-577 (2001)



## NRL has a distinguished history



THOMAS A. EDISON

"GOVERNMENT SHOULD MAINTAIN A GREAT RESEARCH LABORATORY TO DEVELOP GUNS, NEW EXPLOSIVES AND ALL THE TECHNIQUE OF MILITARY AND NAVAL PROGRESSION WITHOUT ANY VAST EXPENSE."

THOMAS A. EDISON, THE NEW YORK TIMES MAGAZINE SUNDAY, MAY 30, 1915

#### A WORLD-CLASS LABORATORY

- Idea followed the sinking of the Lusitania in 1915
- Secretary Josephus Daniels
   Established Naval Consulting Board with
   Edison Chair, meeting October 7, 1915
- August 29, 1916 Congress appropriates funds to establish the Lab
- Delayed by WW-I, Assistant Secretary of the Navy, Theodore Roosevelt, Jr. Commissions the Lab at Bellevue site on July 2, 1923

Primarily In-house Research to support Navy and Marine Corps needs



### Plasma Physics is one of 18 NRL Research Divisions



Ocean & Atmospheric S&T Acoustics Remote Sensing Oceanography Marine Geosciences Marine Meteorology Space Science



Electra Laser Facility



Systems Directorate Radar Information Technology Optical Sciences Tactical Electronics Warfare

Material Science & Component Technology Chemistry Material Science and Technology Laboratory for Computational Physics & Fluid Dynamics Plasma Physics Electronics Science Technology Center for Bio/Molecular Science and Engineering



#### Ex-USS Shadwell, Mobile, AL



Naval Center for Space Technology Space Systems Development Spacecraft Engineering





### NRL has world-wide recognition in plasma physics & related technologies





Naval Research Laboratory Washington, DC 20375-5320 NRL/PU/6790-09-523 NRL **Plasma Formulary** Revised 2009 rowed for public release; distribution is unli





### Non-LTE and non-local phenomena underlie **High Energy Density (HED) plasmas**



#### LTE

(Local Thermodynamic Equilibrium)

(thermal + excitation + ionization) determined by local density and temperature

#### non-LTE





## Non-local means spatial dependence, requiring some form of transport model



 $\Omega_{+i}$ 



Vlasov model

$$V \bullet \nabla f - \frac{eE}{m} \bullet \nabla_V f_m = -\nu_e(V) \left( f - f_m \right) + \frac{\nu_i(V)}{2} \left[ \frac{1}{\sin\theta} \frac{\partial}{\partial\theta} \sin\theta \frac{\partial}{\partial\theta} + \frac{1}{\sin^2\theta} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial\phi^2} \right] f$$

Molecular Dynamics











## Z pinches: magnetically imploded plasma producing intense radiation







## gas puff

Osin, et al., *IEEE TPS*, **39**, 2392 (2011) Mehlhorn Non-LTE/Non-Local IPAM Talk



## Z-pinch research in MHD and radiation production in is internationally active





Mehlhorn Non-LTE/Non-Local IPAM Talk



## Advanced simulations of Z-pinch loads require an integrated physics approach



Division





- □ Verification tests for non-LTE radiation & MHD codes.
- □ Validation of simulations through yields & synthetic spectra.
- □ Interpretation of plasma conditions from spectral & imaging diagnostics.
- □ Predictions for next generation pulse power machines.



## Non-LTE/non-local physics is important in radiation-dominated Z-pinch plasmas



**Radiation transport:** The collection of processes in which radiation is emitted within a medium, and is subsequently absorbed elsewhere within the medium, or else escapes without further interaction

#### Effects:

- Emitted radiative power from an optically thick medium is reduced by reabsorption
- Energy is redistributed within the medium, resulting in localized heating or cooling
- Photoexcitation and/or photoionization results in enhancement of the medium's degree of excitation and ionization
- Boundary effects of the radiation field create gradients in ionization and excitation even if temperature and density are uniform
- Spectral line or continuum features of varying optical depth can provide valuable diagnostics of, e.g., temperatures, densities, and their gradients





Mehlhorn Non-LTE/Non-Local IPAM Talk





- Local Thermodynamic Equilibrium (LTE) means that the ionization state distribution and bound state populations are given by the Saha and Boltzmann equations, respectively, evaluated at the local temperature and density.
  - The particles which dominate the population kinetics must have a Maxwellian velocity distribution, and
  - The population kinetics must be dominated by collisional processes, or the medium must be effectively thick
- In HED plasmas radiation is an important energy term:
  - Simple emission model can be used if radiation is Planckian
  - *else* frequency-dependent emission model required (e.g. multi-group diffusion, S<sub>n</sub>, or IMC)





## Animation to show the transition between an LTE & non-LTE plasma



For a plasma of fixed temperature and size the LTE radiation is given by the blackbody spectrum. For a non-LTE plasma the radiation increases with the density until collisions dominate the kinetics, eventually going to the LTE limit.

Plasma

Physics Division



#### Detailed atomic structure + kinetic rates are fundamental data to non-LTE plasma models



Dasgupta, R. W. Clark, et al., *AIP* #1161, **207** (2009) Dasgupta, J. G. Giuliani, et al., *IEEE TPS*, **38**, 598 (2010) Plasma

Physics Division



## Radiative transfer equation and its' formal solution



$$\frac{dI_{v}}{ds} = j_{v} - k_{v}I_{v}\left(-\frac{1}{c}\frac{\partial I_{v}}{\partial t}\right)$$
  

$$I_{v}(s_{0}) = I_{v}(0)e^{-\tau_{v}(0)} + \int_{0}^{s_{0}}j_{v}(s)e^{-\tau_{v}(s)}ds \quad \tau_{v}(s_{0}) = \int_{s}^{s_{0}}k_{v}(x)dx$$

*emission coefficient*,  $j_v$ , is the radiative power emitted per unit volume, per unit frequency interval, per unit solid angle.

*absorption coefficient*,  $k_{\nu}$ , is the product of the absorption cross section at frequency v and the local density of absorbers

Optical depth  $\tau_v$ , is the line integral of the absorption coefficient along the path



#### Non-local radiation transport requires ray tracing between zones







In multi-dimensional simulations advanced approaches to non-LTE are required

LTE tables the plasma ionization & radiation depend only on the local density and temperature.

In non-LTE the plasma ionization & radiation also depend upon the optical depth of each emission line and the photo-pumping from distant regions.

The Tabular Collisional-Radiative Equilibrium (TCRE) model incorporates these features using a three parameter look-up: density, internal energy (E), and probability-of-escape (P<sub>k,i</sub>).

Properties determined from exact solutions of a uniform plasma.



Thornhill, Apruzese, et al., PoP, 8, 3480 (2001)



Plasma

Physics Division



#### Combine resistive MHD (MACH2) in R-Z with TCRE to match SS K-shell yields



Thornhill, Giuliani, et al., *IEEE TPS*, 38, 606 (2010) Thornhill, Chong, et al., *PoP*, 14, 063301 (2007) Plasma

Physics Division



## Advanced simulations also applied in a predictive mode seeking photons >10 keV





Velikovich, Apruzese, Davis, et al., IEEE TPS, 38, 618 (2010).



## Matching synthetic spectra to observed K-shell data provide averaged plasma conditions





Calculate synthetic spectra from a static cylindrical plasma. Use absolute power and line ratios to form a diagnostic plane.

calc powers and ratios from experimental spectra SS





	Z580	Z1860
Pinch size	~1.2mm	0.9mm
Cr/Fe	~0.4	0.6
K-shell P	7.5TW/cm	7.5TW/cm
N <sub>i</sub> (cm <sup>-3</sup> )	1.2x10 <sup>20</sup>	4x10 <sup>20</sup>
T <sub>e</sub> (keV)	2.6	1.25

Deeney, Apruzese, Coverdale, et al., PRL, 93, 155001 (2004).



3/27/2012

## Line opacity and Doppler shifts due to motion interact to give spectral features







## Comparison of radial and temporal resolved synthetic spectra with data



#### Sandia National Laboratories

3/27/2012

Plasma

Physics Division



### NRL is the world leader in direct drive inertial confinement fusion with KrF lasers



#### Nike Laser Target Chamber



#### Electra 5 Hz electron-beam-pumped KrF laser



- Laser facilities
  - NIKE: 3 kJ KrF laser (0.25  $\mu$ m, 4 ns) S. Obenschain
  - Electra KrF laser development facility (700 J, 5 Hz) J. Sethian
- Research activities:
  - ICF Target physics Laser plasma interactions, RT instabilities, shock ignition
  - Laser Science High power KrF, repetitive KrF and solid-state pulsed power
- Vision:
  - Contribute to future US Inertial Fusion Energy program



### Non-local electron transport is important for direct-drive ICF targets



- Laser energy deposited at critical surface (Inverse Bremsstrahlung)
- Electron thermal conduction transports energy to ablation surface
- Normal diffusion (q = -κ∇T) invalid when thermal gradients between hot corona and cold fuel become too large
- Insufficient electrons to carry heat flux transport becomes "flux limited"
- Generation of high-energy electrons with low collisionality can lead to energy deposition into fuel (preheat) – "nonlocal transport"



Plasma

Physics Division



# Question: Why is there a problem with classical transport?



Answer: Because classical transport assumes mean free path of energy carrying electrons is small compared to gradient scale length.



Typical (N<sub>e</sub>, T<sub>e</sub>) profiles for spherical central ignition implosion

Red arrows are electron mean free path for energy =  $10T_e$ 



### Why do we care about electron transport in ICF?



Direct Drive:

- Shock timing depends on electron transport
- Preheat from hot electrons increases adiabat & decreases compression (stabilizes RT?)

Indirect Drive:

- High flux model with f=0.15 gives cooler plasma in NIF hohlraum – changes laser-plasma growth rates
- "Hohlraum energy balance, as measured by x-ray power escaping the LEH, is quantitatively consistent with revised estimates of backscatter and incident laser energy combined with a more rigorous non-local-thermodynamicequilibrium atomic physics model with greater emissivity than the simpler average-atom model used in the original design of NIF targets"\*

\*Town, R. P. J., M. D. Rosen, et al. (2011). "Analysis of the National Ignition Facility ignition hohlraum energetics experiments." <u>Physics of Plasmas</u> **18**(5): 056302-056308.





- Don't expect the flux to be greater than nmv<sub>e</sub><sup>3</sup>, so many codes have a model to limit it to q< fnmv<sub>e</sub><sup>3</sup>
- f<sub>e</sub> = min(k<sub>e</sub>dT/dx; f<sub>L</sub>nvT) or smoother harmonic mean
- A properly chosen flux limit in a fluid simulation can almost always reproduce a single experimental result.



## High Flux Model (HFM) gives better agreement with NIC hohlraum data



- "The HFM contains two principal changes from the standard model:
  - 1) It uses a detailed configuration accounting (DCA) atomic physics non-local-thermodynamic-equilibrium (NLTE) model, and
  - 2) It uses a generous electron thermal flux limiter, f = 0.15, that is consistent with a non-local electron transport model.
- Both elements make important contributions to the HFM's prediction of a hohlraum plasma that is cooler than that predicted by the standard model, which uses an NLTE average atom approach, and a value of f = 0.05 for the flux limiter. This cooler plasma is key in eliminating most of the discrepancies between the NIC data and revised expectations based on this new simulation model."

Rosen, M. D., H. A. Scott, et al. (2011). "The role of a detailed configuration accounting (DCA) atomic physics package in explaining the energy balance in ignition-scale hohlraums." High Energy Density Physics 7(3): 180-190.







- mfp > scale length, so energy advances ahead of front:
  - $q < fnmv_e^3$  means T>[q/f]<sup>2/3</sup>m<sup>1/3</sup>
- Too low a flux limit gives too high a temperature (e.g. NIF hohlraum & impact on SRS threshold)
- It certainly cannot predict preheat, as this is absent from a flux limit formulation.
- Can one pick a flux limit to agree with more than one measurement?
- How do you pick f anyway?





• Collision term in Vlasov Equation:

$$V \bullet \nabla f - \frac{eE}{m} \bullet \nabla_V f_m = -v_e(V) \left( f - f_m \right) + \frac{v_i(V)}{2} \left[ \frac{1}{\sin\theta} \frac{\partial}{\partial\theta} \sin\theta \frac{\partial}{\partial\theta} + \frac{1}{\sin^2\theta} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial\phi^2} \right] f$$

Can solve analytically for q, it describes BOTH flux limitation and preheat.



Classical like flux but with reduced coefficient (flux limitation)

$$q = -\int_{0}^{\Xi_{cr}} d\Xi \alpha(\Xi) \frac{\partial T}{\partial x} \left( = K \frac{\partial T}{\partial x}, K < K_{sp} \right) - \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} dx' \int_{\Xi_{cr}}^{\infty} d\Xi \frac{\alpha(x', \Xi)}{2\lambda(x', \Xi)} \frac{\partial T}{\partial x'} \exp \left( - \left| \int_{x'}^{x} \frac{dx''}{\lambda(x'', \Xi)} \right| \right) \right)$$

nonlocal effect (preheat)

 $(\Xi \text{ is a particle energy})$ 

Flux limitation and preheat are two sides of the same coin.

Plasma Physics

Division



#### 1-D VDK results in good agreement with Fokker-Planck , flux limiter under predicts Te @ front







## Application of Krook model to KrF shock ignition target implosion



- Comparison of shock ignition target calculations for VDK and f=0.075.
- Absorption increased from 85% to 90%, but gain drops from 140 to 100 due to preheat. (Ref 6)
- Increased alpha might in outer part of fuel might give rise to further RT stability.

Plasma

Physics Division





#### Approach presently implemented and in testing:

- Assume single collision frequency and solve first order equation. Solution same in 1-, 2-, or 3-D, but have to sum over angles to get q.
- Let 1-D Legendre solution guide how to select collision frequency.
- If there is a dominant direction (i.e. r for spherical, z for foil acceleration), the result reduces to decoupled non-local diffusion in each direction.
- The result can be implemented densely (i.e. at every point in each direction) or sparsely, (i.e. at a subset of point with interpolation).

Note: Fokker Planck not numerically tractable – 1) too many orders of magnitude to resolve, 2) only valid for large  $\Lambda$ , but  $\Lambda$  is small in many regions of a laser plasma



### **Comparison of 2-D theory and experiment at the three irradiances on Omega @UR-LLE**





Impact of non-local transport greater with increasing laser irradiance



Velocity Dependent Krook best compromise between physics and numerical practicality



- Treats both flux limitation and preheat.
- Has proper treatment of both high and low velocity electrons.
- Shows a significant effect on laser pellet design, but certainly is not a show stopper.
  - So far we found redesigned pellet has reduced gain, but not by much (~10-25%).
- There may also be stabilizing effect on RT which we are examining now.





- 1. W. Manheimer, D. Colombant and V. Goncharov, Phys. Plasmas, 15, 083103, 2008
- 2. D. Colombant and W. Manheimer, Phys. Plasmas, 15, 083104, 2008
- 3. D. Colombant and W. Manheimer, Phys. Plasmas, 16, 0627051, 2009
- 4. D. Colombant and W. Manheimer, J. Comp. Phys 229, 4369, (2010)
- 5. D. Colombant and W. Manheimer, Phys Plasmas, 17, 112706, (2010)
- 6. W. Manheimer, D. Colombant, and A Schmitt, submitted to Phys. Plasmas
- 7. <u>V. Goncharov</u>, et al, Phys. Plasmas, **13**, 012702, 2006
- 8. V. Goncharov, et al, Phys. Plasmas, 15, 056310, 2008
- 9. G. Schurtz, P. Nicolai, and M. Busquet, Phys. Plasmas 7, 4238, 2000
- 10. J. Matte and J. Virmont, Phys Rev Let 49, 1936 (1982)

Reference on Fokker Planck:

 Mehlhorn, T. A. and J. J. Duderstadt (1980). "A discrete ordinates solution of the Fokker-Planck equation characterizing charged particle transport." <u>Journal of</u> <u>Computational Physics</u> 38(1): 86-106.



## Ultra-Short Pulsed Lasers (USPL) – from physics to applications







# Laser cluster interactions: creation of hot dense plasma



Division









# Laser cluster interactions: creation of extreme state of matter



Typical cluster parameters		Cluster dynamics	
Atom density	~5x10 <sup>22</sup> cm <sup>-3</sup> (solid density)	Formation of highly charged	Cluster explosion & generation
Cluster size	~10 nm	ions and X-ray generation	of high-energy particles
Cluster volume	~10 <sup>-18</sup> cm <sup>3</sup>		
Absorbed energy	~0.1 nJ	Xe <sup>(n+1)+</sup>	
Absorbed energy density	~10 <sup>8</sup> J/cm <sup>3</sup>	X-rays	
Interaction time	~100 fs		
State of matter	fully ionized, highly charged		
Radiation emission	X-rays (1-100 A)		
Absorbed energy density ~ 10 <sup>8</sup> J/cm <sup>3</sup>		Xe ———	

- □ Laser-cluster interactions create <u>extreme conditions</u> and lead to high-energy density laboratory plasma.
- □The cluster dynamics is highly <u>non-local</u> and <u>non-equilibrium</u> due to the impact of the enormous electromagnetic fields of the laser (electric field > 10<sup>12</sup> V/m).
- □ Enhanced energy absorption leads to <u>highly charged ions</u> and <u>X-ray generation</u>









### **Coupling of particle simulations** to atomic physics



#### Molecular dynamics simulation of small Xe clusters



#### Atomic physics of small Xe clusters





### Measured and simulated spectra from highly charged Xe







 $Xe^{37+}(2\bar{s}2\bar{p})$  Double-Hole Line Amplification

 $Xe^{37+}(2\bar{s}2\bar{p})$   $2s2p^{6}3s^{2}3p^{6} \leftarrow 2s2p^{5}3s^{2}3p^{6}3d$ 

Ref: A. B. Borisov, J. Phys. B, **38** 3935–3944 (2005)

Recorded time-integrated spectrum from a plasma channel with a mica equipped von Hamos spectrograph demonstrating amplification on the (2s2p) Xe<sup>37+</sup> double-vacancy array at  $\lambda$ =2.804 A. The magnitude of the amplification represented by the narrow line at  $\lambda$ = 2.804 A is estimated to be ~10<sup>6</sup>.

Calculated oxygen-like xenon snapshot spectrum from small Xe clusters. Simulation parameters:

Ion density:2x10<sup>20</sup> cm<sup>-3</sup> Ion temperature: 4 keV Electron temperature: 40 keV





### Non-LTE and non-local phenomena underlie **High Energy Density (HED) plasmas**



104

#### LTE





#### Thank you for your attention Are there any questions?





3/27/2012

Mehlhorn Non-LTE/Non-Local IPAM Talk

TM/SM

#### Naval Research Laboratory



### **Workshop Goals**



- Scientific Overview
- The physics of hot, dense plasmas is a field rich with physics and mathematics, spanning many different length and time scales. To accurately simulate hot, dense plasmas requires resolving the physics of hydrodynamics, radiation and electron transport, atomic physics, burn physics, wavewave interactions, wave-particle interactions and particle-particle interactions, to name a few processes.
- To perform such a calculation that resolves such physics at all these length and time scales remains computationally unfeasible even with an exascale capability. Thus, it is important to differentiate between the physics that must be fully resolved, and the physics that can be included with a reduced model description in a fully integrated simulation. These fully integrated simulations including reduced model descriptions can then be validated through experiment.
- The goals of this workshop are:
- to identify key physics components in integrated simulations of hot, dense plasmas
- to identify critical computation issues at the different length and time scales
- to propose reduced model descriptions that can be experimentally validated
- to define experiments critical to an integrated simulation of hot, dense plasmas
- to promote new collaborations
- to engage young scientists
- It is the goal of this workshop to bring together mathematicians, computer scientists, and physicists, who work in the area of hot dense plasmas. We expect this workshop will to attract junior as well as senior participants.
- This workshop will include a poster session; a request for posters will be sent to registered participants in advance of the workshop.



### The Role of Non-Local and Non-Equilibrium Physics in High Energy Density Plasmas



There is a large class of problems in high energy density plasmas where the approximations of locality and equilibrium are invalid. In this talk I will consider three different systems: 1) K-shell Z-pinch radiation sources are not in LTE (local thermal dynamic equilibrium) and where non-local line radiation transport affects the plasma dynamics; 2) in laser generated plasmas, the mean free path of the heat conducting electrons can be greater than the temperature gradient scale length and the classical, local model can be invalid; and 3) when atomic clusters are irradiated by high-intensity ultrashort laser pulses the electric field of the laser is orders of magnitude greater than the Bohr electric field associated with the atoms, the ionization kinetics is time dependent (non-equilibrium), and all the tools and methodologies used in the isolated atom regime are negated. Simulating HED plasmas in LTE and where local transport is valid can be challenging to algorithms, databases, and computational hardware. Including these non-local and non-equilibrium effects is even more formidable, requiring trade-offs to be made between physics fidelity and computationally practicality. The choice of computational algorithm (e.g. hydrodynamics, particle-in-cell, or molecular dynamics; or diffusion, Krook, or Fokker Planck) is highly dependent upon the specific problem and degree of non-locality. This talk will provide an overview of each of these systems and their applications, the role of non-local and non-equilibrium physics, the computational physics challenge of including these effects, and a roadmap for future improvements.

#### **References:**

J.W. Thornhill, J.L. Giuliani, A. Dasgupta, et al., IEEE Trans. Plasma Sci., 38, 606 (2010).
G.M Petrov, J. Davis, Phys. Plasmas 15, 056705 (2008)
W. Mannheimer: APS DPP 2011: http://meetings.aps.org/link/BAPS.2011.DPP.YI3.3

In collaboration with A Dasgupta, J Davis, J Giuliani, W Mannheimer, and G Petrov, L Petrova, W Thornhill