IPAM WORKSHOP "ENERGY CONSERVATION AND WASTE HEAT RECOVERY" – 18^{TH} - 22^{ND} November 2013

THERMAL TRANSPORT FROM FIRST PRINCIPLES

Christian Carbogno and Matthias Scheffler



Fritz-Haber-Institut der Max-Planck-Gesellschaft, Berlin – Germany

MAX-PLANCK-GESELLSCHAFT

The Thermoelectric Effect

J_h	</th
$J_h = -(\kappa_{ph} + \kappa_{el}) \nabla T$	Efficiency: figure of merit
$\nabla U = -S_{el} \nabla T$ $J_q = -\sigma_{el} \nabla U$	$\implies zT = \frac{S_{el}^2 \sigma_{el} T}{\kappa_{ph} + \kappa_{el}}$

G.A. Slack, CRC Handbook of Thermoelectrics, CRC Press (1995).



The Harmonic Approximation

The total energy **E** is a **3N-dimensional surface:** $E = V (\mathbf{R}_1, \mathbf{R}_2, \cdots, \mathbf{R}_N)$





Determine *harmonic force constants* Φ_{ij} :

- from Density-Functional Perturbation Theory
 S. Baroni, P. Giannozzi, and A. Testa, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 58, 1861 (1987) &
 S. Baroni, *et al., Rev. Mod. Phys.* 73, 515 (2001).
- from Finite Differences
 - K. Kunc, and R. M. Martin, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **48**, 406 (1982) & K. Parlinski, Z. Q. Li, and Y. Kawazoe, Phys. Rev. Lett. 78, 4063 (1997).



Beyond the Harmonic Approximation

E



The phonon-phonon interaction limits the vibrational thermal conductivity.

Deviations from the harmonic approximation limit the vibrational thermal conductivity.



G.A. Slack, CRC Handbook of Thermoelectrics, CRC Press (1995).



G.A. Slack, CRC Handbook of Thermoelectrics, CRC Press (1995).

$$zT = \frac{S_{el}^2 \sigma_{el} T}{\kappa_{ph} + \kappa_{el}}$$

Minimize phonon heat conductivity, but do not disturb electronic transport!

Example: Si_xGe(1-x) Random Alloys



J. Garg, N. Bonini, B. Kozinsky, and N. Marzari, Phys. Rev. Lett. 106, 045901 (2011).

G.A. Slack, CRC Handbook of Thermoelectrics, CRC Press (1995).





e.g., Y. He, D. Donadio, and G. Galli, *Nano Letters* 11, 3608 (2011). I. Savić, D. Donadio, F. Gygi, and G. Galli *Appl. Phys. Lett.* 102 073113 (2013)

G.A. Slack, CRC Handbook of Thermoelectrics, CRC Press (1995).



Nature **489**, 414 (2012).

Is Nano- & Mesostructuring **the** Answer?

YTTRIA-STABILIZED ZIRCONIA

Yttria-stabilized Zirconia coatings play a crucial role in thermal barrier coatings.



YTTRIA-STABILIZED ZIRCONIA



Pristine, single crystal ZrO₂ exhibits the same thermal conductivity as a disordered, random SiGe alloy.

Why?

~400 µm

CFM 56-7 airplane engine

CFM56-7

THE PHASE DIAGRAM



T < I200°C

D. R. Clarke and C. G. Levi, Annu. Rev. Mat. Res. 33, 383 (2003).

THE PHASE DIAGRAM



 $1200^{\circ}C < T < 2400^{\circ}C$

D. R. Clarke and C. G. Levi, Annu. Rev. Mat. Res. 33, 383 (2003).

THE PHASE DIAGRAM



D. R. Clarke and C. G. Levi, Annu. Rev. Mat. Res. 33, 383 (2003).

C. Carbogno, C. G. Levi, C. G. Van de Walle, and M. Scheffler (to be submitted).





S. Fabris, A.T. Paxton, and M.W. Finnis, *Phys. Rev. B* 61, 6617 (2000).
S. Fabris, A.T. Paxton, and M.W. Finnis, *Phys. Rev. B* 63, 094101 (2001).
M. Sternik and K. Parlinski, *J. Chem. Phys.* 123, 204708 (2005).

C. Carbogno, C. G. Levi, C. G. Van de Walle, and M. Scheffler (to be submitted).



G. Stapper, M. Bernasconi, N. Nicoloso, and M. Parrinello, *Phys. Rev. B* 59, 797 (1999).
A. Eichler, *Phys. Rev. B* 64, 174103 (2001).
H. Ding, A.V.Virkar, and F. Liu, *Solid State Ionics* 215, 16 (2012).

...and many more!

5. Fabris, A. T. Paxton, and M. W. Finnis, *Phys. Rev. B* 63, 094101 (2001)

M. Sternik and K. Parlinski, J. Chem. Phys. 123, 204708 (2005).

C. Carbogno, C. G. Levi, C. G. Van de Walle, and M. Scheffler (to be submitted).

Primitive Unit-cell Artificially Constrains the Dynamics!







C. Carbogno, C. G. Levi, C. G. Van de Walle, and M. Scheffler (to be submitted).



ZrO₂ exhibits **not one**, **but six degenerate**

equilibrium configurations.

Ferroelastic Switches between these configurations

occur quite **frequently**.

Severe violation of the harmonic approximation.



TIME AND LENGTH SCALES



TIME AND LENGTH SCALES



BOLTZMANN TRANSPORT EQUATION

R. Peierls, Ann. Phys. **395**,1055 (1929). D. A. Broido et al., Appl. Phys. Lett. **91**, 231922 (2007).



Boltzmann-Peierls-Transport-Equation describes the evolution of the **phonon** phase space distribution $f(\omega,q,t)$.

BOLTZMANN TRANSPORT EQUATION

R. Peierls, Ann. Phys. **395**,1055 (1929). D. A. Broido et al., Appl. Phys. Lett. **91**, 231922 (2007).



Phonon Lifetimes from First Principles

from Density Functional Perturbation Theory

D. A. Broido et al., Appl. Phys. Lett. **91**, 231922 (2007). J. Garg et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. **106**, 045901 (2011).

- from fitting the forces in ab initio MD
 K. Esfarjani, and H.T. Stokes, Phys. Rev. B 77, 144112 (2008).
- from fitting the phonon line width determined via ab initio MD
 N. De Koker, Phys. Rev. Lett. 103,125902 (2009).

All these approaches give very accurate results for good thermal conductors at low temperatures.

Results are questionable at high levels of anharmonicity!

FIRST-PRINCIPLES APPROACHES

	Order of interaction	Validity & Applicability	Finite Size Effects	Disorder
Boltzmann- Transport Eq.	~ (r ³)	low T	Minute	Parameter
Non-Equilib. MD				
Laser-flash MD				
Green-Kubo MD				

Boltzmann-Transport-Eq. gives very accurate results for perfect crystals at low temperatures.

NON-EQUILIBRIUM MD

S. Stackhouse, L. Stixrude, and B. B. Karki, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **104**, 208501 (2010).



FIRST-PRINCIPLES APPROACHES

	Order of interaction	Validity & Applicability	Finite Size Effects	Disorder
Boltzmann- Transport Eq.	~ (r ³)	low T	Minute	Parameter
Non-Equilib. MD	Full	all T	Huge	as in supercell
Laser-flash MD				
Green-Kubo MD				

Non-Equilibrium MD approaches are in principle exact, in DFT however prohibitively costly to converge accurately.

"LASER FLASH" SIMULATIONS

T. M. Gibbons and S. K. Estreicher, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **102**, 255502 (2009). T. M. Gibbons, By. Kang, S. K. Estreicher, and C. Carbogno, *Phys. Rev. B* **84**, 035317 (2011).

Mimic the "Laser-Flash Measurements" in ab initio MD simulations:



(A) **Prepare two supercells:** a **small hot** one and a **large cold** one.

"LASER FLASH" SIMULATIONS

T. M. Gibbons and S. K. Estreicher, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **102**, 255502 (2009). T. M. Gibbons, By. Kang, S. K. Estreicher, and C. Carbogno, *Phys. Rev. B* **84**, 035317 (2011).

Mimic the "Laser-Flash Measurements" in ab initio MD simulations:



(A) **Prepare two supercells:** a **small hot** one and a **large cold** one.

(B) Let the heat diffuse via *ab initio* MD and monitor the temperature profile T(x,t).

FIRST-PRINCIPLES APPROACHES

	Order of interaction	Validity & Applicability	Finite Size Effects	Disorder
Boltzmann- Transport Eq.	~ (r ³)	low T	Minute	Parameter
Non-Equilib. MD	Full	all T	Huge	as in supercell
Laser-flash MD	Full	low T	Medium- Large	as in supercell
Green-Kubo MD				

Laser-flash MD yields accurate qualitative results at low temperatures within moderate computational costs. Quantitative predictions require finite size corrections, though.

Fluctuation-Dissipation Theorem

Brownian Motion:

A. Einstein, Ann. Phys. 322, 549 (1905).

The erratic motion of the particles is closely related to frictional force under perturbation.



The fluctuations of the forces in thermodynamic equilibrium is related to the generalized resistance in non-equilibrium for linear dissipative systems.

H. B. Callen, and T.A. Welton, *Phys. Rev.* 83, 34 (1951).

GREEN-KUBO METHOD

R. Kubo, M. Yokota, and S. Nakajima, J. Phys. Soc. Japan 12, 1203 (1957).

Fluctuation-Dissipation Theorem

Simulations of the thermodynamic equilibrium

$$\kappa \sim \int\limits_{0}^{\infty} d au \left\langle \mathbf{J}(0) \; \mathbf{J}(au)
ight
angle_{\scriptscriptstyle eq}$$

The thermal conductivity is related to the autocorrelation function of the heat flux



THE ATOMISTIC HEAT FLUX

E. Helfand, *Phys. Rev.* **119**, 1 (1960).

$$\mathbf{J}(t) = \frac{d}{dt} \left(\sum_{i} \mathbf{r}_{i}(t) \varepsilon_{i}(t) \right) \qquad \begin{array}{c} \mathbf{r}_{i} & \cdots & \text{Position of atom } i \\ \varepsilon_{i} & \cdots & \text{Energy of atom } i \end{array} \right)$$

Energy contribution E_i of the individual atoms required!

⇒ Green-Kubo Method hitherto only used with classical potentials!

BASICS OF MACROSCOPIC TRANSPORT







BASICS OF MACROSCOPIC TRANSPORT

E. Helfand, *Phys. Rev.* **119**, 1 (1960).



THE AB INITIO HEAT FLUX

$$\mathbf{J}(t) = \frac{d}{dt} \int \mathbf{r} \cdot \varepsilon(\mathbf{r}, t) d\mathbf{r} \quad \varepsilon(\mathbf{r}, t) \quad \cdots \quad \text{Energy density}$$

Energy Density in Density Functional Theory: B. Delley et al., Phys. Rev. B 27, 2132 (1983). N. Chetty, and R. M. Martin, Phys. Rev. B 45, 6074 (1992).

 $\int \varepsilon(\mathbf{r}, \{\mathbf{R}\}) d\mathbf{r} \iff$ Harris-Foulkes Total Energy Functional

$$\varepsilon(\mathbf{r}, \{\mathbf{R}\}) = \sum_{i} T_{i} + \sum_{l} \varepsilon_{l} f_{l}^{occ} |\Psi_{l}(\mathbf{r})|^{2} - n(\mathbf{r}) v_{xc} [n(\mathbf{r})]$$
$$+ E_{xc} [n(\mathbf{r})] - \frac{1}{2} n(\mathbf{r}) v_{es}(\mathbf{r}) + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \frac{Z_{i} Z_{j}}{|\mathbf{R}_{i} - \mathbf{R}_{j}|} \delta(\mathbf{r} - \mathbf{R}_{i})$$

ASSESSING THE THERMAL CONDUCTIVITY

$$\kappa = \frac{V}{3k_B T^2} \int_{0}^{\infty} d\tau \left\langle \mathbf{J}(0) \mathbf{J}(\tau) \right\rangle_{_{eq}}$$

Fourier Trans.
$$\kappa = \frac{V}{3k_BT^2} \lim_{\omega \to 0} |\mathbf{J}(\omega)|^2$$

Finite Size Artifacts artificially reduce the thermal conductivity at low frequencies!

J. L. Feldman *et al.*, *Phys. Rev. B* **48**, 12589 (1993).



PERIODIC BOUNDARY CONDITIONS



Small heat flux through boundaries leads to huge change in energy barycenter.

CORRECTING FOR FINITE SIZE EFFECTS

J. L. Feldman et al., Phys. Rev. B 48,12589 (1993).

$$\kappa_{FS}(\omega) = \kappa(\omega) - \Theta_{FS}(\omega) = \sum_{n} \frac{\kappa_n}{1 + \alpha_n \,\omega^2} - \frac{\kappa_{\text{art}}}{1 + \alpha_{\text{art}} \,\omega^2}$$



THE AB INITIO HEAT FLUX



THE AB INITIO HEAT FLUX

Formulas for analytical stress



ELIMINATING THE FINITE SIZE ARTIFACTS

R. J. Hardy, Phys. Rev. 132,168 (1963).



FINITE SIZE ARTIFACTS ELIMINATED!

APPLICATION TO ZIRCONIA



Experiment:

J.-F. Bisson et al., J. Am. Cer. Soc. 83, 1993 (2000).
G. E. Youngblood et al., J. Am. Cer. Soc. 71, 255 (1988).
S. Raghavan et al., Scripta Materialia 39, 1119 (1998).

Classical MD:

P. K. Schelling, and S. R. Phillpot, J. Am. Cer. Soc. **84**, 2997 (2001).

FIRST-PRINCIPLES APPROACHES

	Order of interaction	Validity & Applicability	Finite Size Effects	Disorder
Boltzmann- Transport Eq.	~ (r ³)	low T	Minute	Parameter
Non-Equilib. MD	Full	all T	Huge	as in supercell
Laser-flash MD	Full	low T	Medium- Large	as in supercell
Green-Kubo MD	Full	all T>T _D	Small	as in supercell

Ab initio Green-Kubo approach allows the accurate and predictive computation of lattice thermal conductivities K at arbitrarily high temperatures!

Outlook & Discussion

...for the mathematicians...

The Harmonic Approximation



Is a *Taylor Expansion* the best possible approach for this problem?

Wish list:

- **Global** Approximation Theory \Rightarrow No R_0 dependence!
- Multi-dimensional Theory ⇒ (Truncated) interactions matter!
- Accurate description of "anharmonicity"! ⇒ Predictive!
- Numerically **rapid** both in **generation** and **evaluation**!

Outlook & Discussion

...for the rest of us...

Promising Thermoelectric Materials

Many *novel* thermoelectric materials feature **cavities**, that can be filled with **guest atoms**.



- Quasi-free guest atoms give rise to strong anharmonic effects that can be captured with the Green-Kubo method.
- Varying the species and the concentration of guest atoms gives ample opportunities for optimization.

Promising Thermoelectric Materials

Many novel thermoelectric materials feature **cavities**, that can be filled with **guest atoms**.



- Quasi-free guest atoms give rise to strong anharmonic effects that can be captured with the Green-Kubo method.
- Varying the species and the concentration of guest atoms gives ample opportunities for optimization.





Conclusion

Higher-order anharmonic effects can play a decisive role for the thermal conductivity.

Ab initio Green-Kubo approach allows the accurate and predictive computation of thermal conductivities κ for highly anharmonic systems & at arbitrarily high temperatures!

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

