HANDS-ON TUTORIAL WORKSHOP, JULY 29TH 2014

# PHONONS & THERMAL TRANSPORT

Christian Carbogno



Fritz-Haber-Institut der Max-Planck-Gesellschaft, Berlin - Germany

MAX-PLANCK-GESELLSCHAFT

## CRYSTALLINE SOLIDS

#### Idealized Crystal Structure



#### Infinite grid of immobile atoms with perfect periodicity

cf. Christian Ratsch, Tuesday July 22

#### **Real Materials**



#### Everything moves!

cf. M. Rossi & L. Ghiringhelli, Friday July 25

Perfect periodicity disturbed!

### FAILURES OF THE STATIC LATTICE MODEL

N.W Ashcroft and N.D. Mermin, "Solid State Physics" (1976).

- Inaccuracies in the equilibrium properties at OK: Lattice Constants, Cohesive Energies, Elastic Constants,...
- Failure to describe thermodynamic equilibrium properties: Specific Heat, Thermal Lattice Expansion, Phase Transformations, ...
- Failure to describe thermodynamic non-equilibrium properties:
  - Charge Transport: Electrical AC/DC Conductivity, Superconductivity,...
  - Heat Transport: Thermal Conductivity, Transmission of Sound,...
  - Coupling of Charge & Heat Transport:
    Seebeck and Peltier Effect,...
  - Interaction with Radiation:
    X-Ray, Infrared, Neutron, ...

## I.THE HARMONIC CRYSTAL

The total energy **E** is a **3N-dimensional surface:** 

 $E = V\left(\mathbf{R}_1, \mathbf{R}_2, \cdots, \mathbf{R}_N\right)$ 

Approximate by Taylor Expansion around the Static Equilibrium R<sub>i</sub><sup>0</sup>

 $E\left(\{\mathbf{R}_0 + \Delta \mathbf{R}\}\right) \approx E\left(\{\mathbf{R}_0\}\right) + \cdots$ 

 $\tilde{R}^0$ 

Atomic Coordinate  $R_{i}$ 

Total Energy E

Static Equilibrium Energy

The total energy **E** is a **3N-dimensional surface:** 

 $E = V\left(\mathbf{R}_1, \mathbf{R}_2, \cdots, \mathbf{R}_N\right)$ 

Approximate by Taylor Expansion around the Static Equilibrium R<sub>i</sub><sup>0</sup>

 $E\left(\{\mathbf{R}_0 + \Delta \mathbf{R}\}\right) \approx E\left(\{\mathbf{R}_0\}\right) + \sum_{i} \frac{\partial E}{\partial \mathbf{R}_i} \middle|_{\mathbf{R}_0} \Delta \mathbf{R}_i + \cdots$ 

Atomic Coordinate R.

E

**Total Energy** 

Forces vanish at Ro



The total energy **E** is a **3N-dimensional surface:** 

 $E = V\left(\mathbf{R}_1, \mathbf{R}_2, \cdots, \mathbf{R}_N\right)$ 

Approximate by Taylor Expansion around the Static Equilibrium R<sub>i</sub><sup>0</sup>

 $E\left(\{\mathbf{R}_0 + \Delta \mathbf{R}\}\right) \approx E\left(\{\mathbf{R}_0\}\right) + \sum_{i} \frac{\partial E}{\partial \mathbf{R}_i} \bigg|_{\mathbf{R}_0} \Delta \mathbf{R}_i + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{i,j} \left. \frac{\partial^2 E}{\partial \mathbf{R}_i \partial \mathbf{R}_j} \right|_{\mathbf{R}_0} \Delta \mathbf{R}_i \Delta \mathbf{R}_j$ 

Hessian  $\Phi_{ij}$ 



The total energy **E** is a **3N-dimensional surface:** 

 $E = V\left(\mathbf{R}_1, \mathbf{R}_2, \cdots, \mathbf{R}_N\right)$ 

#### WARNING:

Harmonic Approximation is only valid for small displacements from **R**<sup>0</sup>!

 $E\left(\{\mathbf{R}_0 + \Delta \mathbf{R}\}\right) \approx E\left(\{\mathbf{R}_0\}\right) + \sum_i \frac{\partial E}{\partial \mathbf{R}_i} \bigg|_{\mathbf{R}_0} \Delta \mathbf{R}_i + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{i,j} \left. \frac{\partial^2 E}{\partial \mathbf{R}_i \partial \mathbf{R}_j} \right|_{\mathbf{R}_0} \Delta \mathbf{R}_i \Delta \mathbf{R}_j$ 

### Static Equilibrium Energy from DFT

 $E\left(\{\mathbf{R}_0 + \Delta \mathbf{R}\}\right) \approx E\left(\{\mathbf{R}_0\}\right) +$ 

Hessian  $\Phi_{ij}$ 

 $\left. \frac{\partial^2 E}{\partial \mathbf{R}_i \partial \mathbf{R}_j} \right|_{\mathbf{R}_0}$ 

 $\Delta \mathbf{R}_i \Delta \mathbf{R}_j$ 

#### Determine Hessian aka the Harmonic Force Constants $\Phi_{ij}$ :

from Density-Functional Perturbation Theory
 S. Baroni, P. Giannozzi, and A. Testa, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 58, 1861 (1987) &
 S. Baroni, et al., Rev. Mod. Phys. 73, 515 (2001).

 $\sum_{i} \frac{\partial E'}{\partial \mathbf{R}_i} \sum_{\mathbf{R}_0} \Delta \mathbf{R}_i + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=1}^{N} \frac{\partial \mathbf{R}_i}{\partial \mathbf{R}_i} + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=1}^{N} \frac{\partial \mathbf{R}_i}{\partial \mathbf{R}_i} \sum_{i=1}^$ 

### from Finite Differences K. Kunc, and R. M. Martin, Phys. Rev. Lett. 48, 406 (1982) &

K. Parlinski, Z. Q. Li, and Y. Kawazoe, Phys. Rev. Lett. 78, 4063 (1997).

⇒ cf. Christian Carbogno & Manuel Schöttler, Tutorial 6, Tuesday July 29

...in Molecules:



N ... Number of atoms
 ↓
 Degrees of Freedom: 3N
 Dimension of Hessian: 9N<sup>2</sup>

Tuesday July 22: ⇒ Björn Lange, Nuts and Bolts of DFT II ⇒ O. Hofmann & L. Nemec, Tutorial I ...in Crystalline Solids:

-NWW





## PERIODIC BOUNDARY CONDITIONS

cf. Christian Ratsch, "Electronic Structure Theory for Periodic Systems: The Concepts", Tuesday July 22



## VIBRATIONS IN A CRYSTAL 101

K. Parlinski, Z. Q. Li, and Y. Kawazoe, Phys. Rev. Lett. 78, 4063 (1997).

**Real Space:** Hessian  $\Phi_{ij}$ with  $i, j \rightarrow \infty$ 

$$D_{i'j'}(\mathbf{q}) = \sum_{j} \frac{e^{i\left(\mathbf{q} \cdot (\mathbf{R}_{j}^{0} - \mathbf{R}_{j'}^{0})\right)}}{\sqrt{M_{i'}M_{j'}}} \Phi_{i'j}$$

Equivier Transform

**Reciprocal Space:** Dynamical Matrix  $D_{i'j'}(q)$ with  $i',j' \leq N_p$ 

Fourier Transform can be truncated since  $\Phi_{ij} = 0$  for large  $|R_j^0 - R_{j'}^0|$ 

Hessian  $\Phi_{ij}$ with **finite** number of non-zero entries

Dynamical Matrix  $D_{i'j'}(q)$ known for the **whole** reciprocal space

### VIBRATIONS IN A CRYSTAL 101

e.g. N.W Ashcroft and N. D. Mermin, "Solid State Physics" (1976) also see Björn Lange, Nuts and Bolts of DFT II, Tuesday July 22

Dynamical matrix:

$$D_{i'j'}(\mathbf{q}) = \sum_{j} \frac{e^{i\left(\mathbf{q} \cdot (\mathbf{R}_{j}^{0} - \mathbf{R}_{j'}^{0})\right)}}{\sqrt{M_{i'}M_{j'}}} \Phi_{i'j}$$

Equation of Motion becomes an Eigenvalue Problem:  $\mathbf{D}(\mathbf{q}) \ [\boldsymbol{\nu}(\mathbf{q})] = \boldsymbol{\omega}^2(\mathbf{q}) \ [\boldsymbol{\nu}(\mathbf{q})]$ 

Analytical Solution in Real Space: Superposition of Harmonic Oscillations

$$\mathbf{R}_{j}(t) = \mathbf{R}_{j}^{0} + \mathfrak{Re}\left(\sum_{s} \frac{A_{s}}{\sqrt{M_{i}}} e^{i\left(\mathbf{q} \cdot (\mathbf{R}_{j}^{0} - \mathbf{R}_{j'}^{0}) - \boldsymbol{\omega}_{s}(\mathbf{q})t\right)} \cdot \left[\boldsymbol{\nu}_{s}(\mathbf{q})\right]_{j'}\right)$$

### VIBRATIONS IN A CRYSTAL 101

e.g. N.W Ashcroft and N. D. Mermin, "Solid State Physics" (1976)

### For $N_p$ atoms in the unit cell there are:

#### 3 Acoustic modes:

- Atoms in unit cell in-phase
- Acoustic modes vanish at  $\Gamma$
- Strong (typically linear) dispersion close to  $\Gamma$

### $(3N_p - 3)$ Optical modes:

- Atoms in unit cell out-of-phase
- $\omega > 0$  at  $\Gamma$  (and everywhere else)
  - Weak dispersion



### THE HARMONIC FREE ENERGY



## THE HARMONIC FREE ENERGY



## THE ASPIRIN "HEADACHE"

Anthony M. Reilly and Alexandre Tkatchenko, Phys. Rev. Lett. (in press).



Electronic Structure Theory predicts the two polymorphs to be energetically degenerate.

#### **BUT: FORM I MUCH MORE ABUNDANT!**

## THE ASPIRIN "HEADACHE"

Anthony M. Reilly and Alexandre Tkatchenko, Phys. Rev. Lett. (in press).





## THE ASPIRIN "HEADACHE"

Anthony M. Reilly and Alexandre Tkatchenko, Phys. Rev. Lett. (in press).



Understanding polymorphism in organic crystals requires...



... accurate electronic structure theory ... correct description of many-body dispersion ... to account for nuclear motion



## II. LIMITS OF THE HARMONIC APPROXIMATION



#### WARNING:

Harmonic Approximation is only valid for small displacements from **R**<sup>0</sup>!

At elevated temperatures the harmonic approximation becomes increasingly inaccurate – and often terribly misleading!

## THERMAL BARRIER COATINGS

### Zirconia-based coatings play a crucial role in thermal barrier coatings.









## THE SOFT MODE OF CUBIC ZrO2



Cubic Zirconia exhibits a soft mode (imaginary mode):  $\mathbf{D}(\mathbf{X}) \ [\nu(\mathbf{X})] = \omega^2(\mathbf{X}) \ [\nu(\mathbf{X})] \quad \Rightarrow \quad \omega_1^2(\mathbf{X}) < 0$ 

### The Tetragonal-Cubic Phase Transition



S. Fabris, A.T. Paxton, and M.W. Finnis, *Phys. Rev. B* **63**, 094101 (2001). M. Sternik and K. Parlinski, *J. Chem. Phys.* **123**, 204708 (2005).





### Ab initio MD Evidence for Ferroelastic Switching



Distance from cubic geometry  $dr = \sqrt{dx^2 + dy^2 + dz^2}$  always conserved!

 $\Rightarrow$  Ferroelastic switches are an intrinsic feature of the dynamics in ZrO<sub>2</sub>.

### The Dynamics of Zirconia C. Carbogno, C. G. Levi, C. G. Van de Walle, and M. Scheffler (submitted).













ZrO<sub>2</sub> exhibits **not one**, **but six degenerate** equilibrium configurations.

### Ferroelastic Switches between these configurations occur quite frequently.

Severe violation of the harmonic approximation.

# SUMMARY I

We have introduced the harmonic approximation under periodic boundary conditions.

The harmonic approximation can be very useful to approximatively asses dynamic and thermodynamic effects at low temperatures.

The harmonic approximation becomes increasingly inaccurate at elevated temperatures and must be handled with care under such thermodynamic conditions.

## III. HEAT TRANSPORT

## HEATTRANSPORT

### Macroscopic Effect:



Fourier's Law:  $\mathbf{J} = -\kappa \nabla T = -\alpha \rho c_V \nabla T$ 



### Microscopic Mechanisms

### BASICS OF MACROSCOPIC TRANSPORT

The Continuity Equation: (valid for any conserved quantity)

$$\frac{\partial T}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot \mathbf{j} = 0$$

Proportionality of flux and gradient:

The Diffusion Equation: (also applies to mass & charge transport)

 $\frac{\partial T(\mathbf{r},t)}{\partial t} = \kappa \nabla^2 T(\mathbf{r},t)$ 

 $= -\kappa \nabla \mathbf{T}$ 

Analytic Solution:

$$T(\mathbf{r},t) = \frac{1}{(4\pi\kappa t)^{3/2}} \exp\left(-\frac{\mathbf{r}^2}{4\kappa t}\right)$$


### HEAT CONDUCTIVITY 101

E



The phonon-phonon interaction limits the vibrational thermal conductivity.

Deviations from the harmonic approximation limit the vibrational thermal conductivity.



### TIME AND LENGTH SCALES



### BOLTZMANN TRANSPORT EQUATION

R. Peierls, Ann. Phys. **395**,1055 (1929). D. A. Broido et al., Appl. Phys. Lett. **91**, 231922 (2007).



Boltzmann-Peierls-Transport-Equation describes the evolution of the phonon phase space distribution  $f(\omega,q,t)$ .

### (A) BOLTZMANN TRANSPORT EQUATION

R. Peierls, Ann. Phys. **395**,1055 (1929). D. A. Broido et al., Appl. Phys. Lett. **91**, 231922 (2007).

#### Single-mode relaxation time approximation



#### **Phonon Lifetimes from First Principles**

- from Density Functional Perturbation Theory
   D. A. Broido et al., Appl. Phys. Lett. 91, 231922 (2007).
   J. Garg et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 106, 045901 (2011).
- from fitting the forces in ab initio MD
   K. Esfarjani, and H.T. Stokes, Phys. Rev. B 77, 144112 (2008).
- from fitting the phonon line width determined via ab initio MD
   N. De Koker, Phys. Rev. Lett. 103,125902 (2009).

All these approaches give very accurate results for good thermal conductors at low temperatures.

Results are **questionable** at high levels of **anharmonicity**!

### FIRST-PRINCIPLES APPROACHES

	Order of interaction	Validity & Applicability	Finite Size Effects	Disorder
Boltzmann- Transport Eq.	~ (r <sup>3</sup> )	low T	Minute	Parameter
Non-Equilib. MD				
Laser-flash MD				
Green-Kubo MD				

Boltzmann-Transport-Eq. gives very accurate results for perfect crystals at low temperatures.

## NON-EQUILIBRIUM MD

S. Stackhouse, L. Stixrude, and B. B. Karki, Phys. Rev. Lett. 104, 208501 (2010).





P. Schelling, S. Phillpot, and P. Keblinski, *Phys. Rev. B* **65**, 144306 (2002).



Non-equilibrium MD exhibits strong finite-size artifacts in supercells typically accessible within DFT/AIMD.



Non-equilibrium MD can suffer from non-linear artifacts in supercells typically accessible within DFT/AIMD.

### FIRST-PRINCIPLES APPROACHES

	Order of interaction	Validity & Applicability	Finite Size Effects	Disorder
Boltzmann- Transport Eq.	~ (r <sup>3</sup> )	low T	Minute	Parameter
Non-Equilib. MD	Full	all T	Huge	as in supercell
Laser-flash MD				
Green-Kubo MD				

Non-Equilibrium MD approaches are in principle exact, in DFT however prohibitively costly to converge accurately.

### "LASER FLASH" MEASUREMENTS

W. J. Parker et al., J. Appl. Phys. **32**, 1679 (1961).



### "LASER FLASH" MEASUREMENTS

W. J. Parker et al., J. Appl. Phys. 32, 1679 (1961).



T. M. Gibbons and S. K. Estreicher, Phys. Rev. Lett. 102, 255502 (2009).

#### Mimic the "Laser-Flash Measurements" in ab initio MD simulations:



(A) Prepare two supercells: a small hot one and a large cold one.

### Setup of the Cell in Non-Equilibrium

In the harmonic approximation, the **positions r**<sub>i</sub> and the **velocities v**<sub>i</sub> are related to the **vibrational eigenfrequencies ω**<sub>s</sub> and -vectors **e**<sub>s</sub>.



T. M. Gibbons and S. K. Estreicher, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **102**, 255502 (2009).

#### Mimic the "Laser-Flash Measurements" in ab initio MD simulations:



(A) Prepare two supercells: a small hot one and a large cold one.

(B) Let the heat diffuse via *ab initio* MD and monitor the temperature profile T(x,t).

T. M. Gibbons and S. K. Estreicher, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **102**, 255502 (2009).



# The finite number of atoms leads to large temperature fluctuations.

T. M. Gibbons and S. K. Estreicher, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **102**, 255502 (2009).



### APPLICATION TO IMPURITIES IN SI

T. M. Gibbons, By. Kang, S. K. Estreicher, and C. Carbogno, Phys. Rev. B 84, 035317 (2011).



#### Si192 supercell containing ~5.2% impurities

#### How do the properties of the impurities affect the thermal conductivity of the system?

### APPLICATION TO IMPURITIES IN SI

T. M. Gibbons and S. K. Estreicher, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **102**, 255502 (2009).



Thermal conductivity can be controlled via the impurities' mass!

### APPLICATION TO IMPURITIES IN SI

T. M. Gibbons, By. Kang, S. K. Estreicher, and C. Carbogno, Phys. Rev. B 84, 035317 (2011).



Not all impurities are created equal!



SiGe, Stillinger-Weber Potential, Courtesy of Philip Howell, Siemens AG



Laser-flash approach exhibits strong finite-size artifacts in supercells typically accessible within DFT/AIMD.



Preparation of the supercell in **non-equilibrium** via the **harmonic approximation** allows to use **rather small thermal gradients**.

### FIRST-PRINCIPLES APPROACHES

	Order of interaction	Validity & Applicability	Finite Size Effects	Disorder
Boltzmann- Transport Eq.	~ (r <sup>3</sup> )	low T	Minute	Parameter
Non-Equilib. MD	Full	all T	Huge	as in supercell
Laser-flash MD	Full	low T	Medium- Large	as in supercell
Green-Kubo MD				

Laser-flash MD yields accurate qualitative results at low temperatures within moderate computational costs. Quantitative predictions require finite size corrections, though.

# FLUCTUATION-DISSIPATION THEOREM

#### **Brownian Motion:**

A. Einstein, Ann. Phys. 322, 549 (1905).

The erratic motion of the particles is closely related to frictional force under perturbation.



#### Random walk in 2D

The **fluctuations of the forces** in thermodynamic **equilibrium** is related to the generalized resistance in non-equilibrium for linear dissipative systems.

H. B. Callen, and T. A. Welton, *Phys. Rev.* **83**, 34 (1951).

### GREEN-KUBO METHOD

R. Kubo, M. Yokota, and S. Nakajima, J. Phys. Soc. Japan 12, 1203 (1957).

#### **Fluctuation-Dissipation Theorem**

Simulations of the thermodynamic equilibrium

$$\kappa \sim \int_{0}^{\infty} d\tau \left\langle \mathbf{J}(0) \mathbf{J}(\tau) \right\rangle_{eq}$$

The thermal conductivity is related to the autocorrelation function of the heat flux





## THE ATOMISTIC HEAT FLUX

E. Helfand, *Phys. Rev.* **19**, 1 (1960).

$$\mathbf{J}(t) = \frac{d}{dt} \left( \sum_{i} \mathbf{r}_{i}(t) \varepsilon_{i}(t) \right) \qquad \begin{array}{c} \mathbf{r}_{i} & \cdots & \text{Position of atom } i \\ \varepsilon_{i} & \cdots & \text{Energy of atom } i \end{array} \right)$$

Energy contribution  $\mathbf{E}_i$  of the **individual atoms** required!

# ⇒ Green-Kubo Method hitherto only used with classical potentials!

### THE AB INITIO HEAT FLUX

$$\mathbf{J}(t) = \frac{d}{dt} \int \mathbf{r} \cdot \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}(\mathbf{r}, t) d\mathbf{r}$$

$$\varepsilon(\mathbf{r},t)$$
 ... Energy density

#### Energy Density in Density Functional Theory: B. Delley et al., Phys. Rev. B 27, 2132 (1983). N. Chetty, and R. M. Martin, Phys. Rev. B 45, 6074 (1992).

 $\varepsilon(\mathbf{r}, \{\mathbf{R}\}) d\mathbf{r} \Leftrightarrow$  Harris-Foulkes Total Energy Functional

$$\varepsilon(\mathbf{r}, \{\mathbf{R}\}) = \sum_{i} T_{i} + \sum_{l} \varepsilon_{l} f_{l}^{occ} |\Psi_{l}(\mathbf{r})|^{2} - n(\mathbf{r}) v_{xc} [n(\mathbf{r})]$$
$$+ E_{xc} [n(\mathbf{r})] - \frac{1}{2} n(\mathbf{r}) v_{es}(\mathbf{r}) + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \frac{Z_{i} Z_{j}}{|\mathbf{R}_{i} - \mathbf{R}_{j}|} \delta(\mathbf{r} - \mathbf{R}_{i})$$

ASSESSING THE THERMAL CONDUCTIVITY

Fo

$$\kappa = \frac{V}{3k_B T^2} \int_{0}^{\infty} d\tau \left\langle \mathbf{J}(0) \; \mathbf{J}(\tau) \right\rangle_{\epsilon}$$

urier Trans.  

$$\kappa = \frac{V}{3k_BT^2} \lim_{\omega \to 0} |\mathbf{J}(\omega)|^2$$

Finite Size Artifacts artificially reduce the thermal conductivity at low frequencies!

J. L. Feldman *et al.*, *Phys. Rev. B* **48**, 12589 (1993).



### PERIODIC BOUNDARY CONDITIONS



### PERIODIC BOUNDARY CONDITIONS



Small heat flux through boundaries leads to huge change in energy barycenter.

#### ELIMINATING THE FINITE SIZE ARTIFACTS R. J. Hardy, Phys. Rev. 132,168 (1963).



### ELIMINATING THE FINITE SIZE ARTIFACTS

R. J. Hardy, Phys. Rev. 132,168 (1963).

#### Formulas for analytical stress


### ELIMINATING THE FINITE SIZE ARTIFACTS

R. J. Hardy, Phys. Rev. 132,168 (1963).



### FINITE SIZE ARTIFACTS ELIMINATED!

### APPLICATION TO ZIRCONIA



#### **Experiment:**

J.-F. Bisson et al., J.Am. Cer. Soc. 83, 1993 (2000).
G. E. Youngblood et al., J.Am. Cer. Soc. 71, 255 (1988).
S. Raghavan et al., Scripta Materialia 39, 1119 (1998).

#### **Classical MD:**

P. K. Schelling, and S. R. Phillpot, J.Am. Cer. Soc. **84**, 2997 (2001).

# TIME AND LENGTH SCALES



# TIME AND LENGTH SCALES



# FIRST-PRINCIPLES APPROACHES

	Order of interaction	Validity & Applicability	Finite Size Effects	Disorder
Boltzmann- Transport Eq.	~ (r <sup>3</sup> )	low T	Minute	Parameter
Non-Equilib. MD	Full	all T	Huge	as in supercell
Laser-flash MD	Full	low T	Medium- Large	as in supercell
Green-Kubo MD	Full	all T	Small	as in supercell

Ab initio Green-Kubo approach allows the accurate and predictive computation of lattice thermal conductivities K at arbitrarily high temperatures!